

City/Public Agency Survey: Understanding CBO Collaboration & Compensation

Fielding Hong & Kris Chandler, NACTO

June 15th, 2023

The survey received a total of 21 responses, representing 17 jurisdictions in total. 13 city DOT's were represented, as well as 3 transit authorities, and 1 state DOT. Specific regions can be reviewed within the raw data analysis provided below.

Although low turnout rate and regional representation was a critical variable to be considered, we were able to still glean trends and assumptions from the data provided. Our method focused on paying special attention to outliers - both highs and lows - and areas in which respondents specifically noted special circumstances, experiences, or examples.

Based on this method and the synthesis of the data provided, we were able to perceive some general takeaways, in addition to areas for further research and conversation.

Notable takeaways include the following:

- **Half of the respondents have structures in place for collaborating with CBOs:** this could be an opportunity for the coalition to support the sharing of information between cities with regards to those structures, especially to assist and guide cities that may not already have collaboration structures in place.
 - **16 of 21** respondents said there was no “written policy or formal commitment to collaborating with CBOs” and that these collaborations were Ad-hoc/Project Based
 - There was a noted desire to “create more standard policy”
 - **12 of 21** respondents said they don't have a “dedicated system or process in place to *identify* which CBOs to work with.” However, **6 of 21** respondents say a system exists depending on the kind of project.
- **Local funding is a *much* more common source of funding for CBO collaboration than federal funding:** this could be an opportunity for the coalition to focus on strengthening the pathways for federal dollars to be used for CBO compensation.
- **Findings presented numerous barriers to achieving equitable CBO collaboration, which we were able to isolate into 3 separate focus areas - bureaucracy** (administrative, procurement, financial, legal), **structural** (staff capacity, agency structure), and **cultural** (lack of understanding of CBO mission and needs, lack of relationship with CBOs): this could be an opportunity for the coalition to hold conversations about how these barriers might translate into programming support that

could be offered (i.e. capacity building that NACTO offers to cities, and/or that the coalition partners offer to CBOs).

- **Lots of cities are open to talking more:** This is an opportunity for the coalition group to do more in-depth qualitative interviews if resources are available to support such.
- **A vast majority of respondents (19 of 21) said that funding set aside for collaborating with CBOs is either between 0-2% of overall agency budget, or they are not sure:** this could be an opportunity for the coalition to investigate further into how cities allocate funding and at what stage CBO collaboration is being considered with intent, foresight, and care.

For your review, below presents the synthesis of the raw data that was collected from the survey. All data presented below was taken into consideration when drafting the aforementioned takeaways. Again, we wish to note that the data below is only representative of 17 jurisdictions, therefore not being a conclusive understanding of CBO collaboration and engagement within our network.

For your reference, the link to the working draft of the survey can be found [here](#). The working draft includes notes from the coalition group within the comments, in addition to the prospective follow up questions we provided for some of the questions that were represented within the survey.

CBO Survey - A Synthesis of Raw Data

Demographic Overview:

- 21 responses
- 17 Jurisdictions represented, w/ the represented regions listed below:
 - 5 Southwest
 - 1 Mountain West
 - 3 Midwest
 - 5 Northwest
 - 1 Southern
 - 2 Canada
- Agencies/Cities/Authorities
 - 1 State DOT
 - 3 Transit Authority
 - 13 City DOTs

QUESTION 5: To your knowledge, what is your agency/department's operational budget for the current fiscal year?

- Did not respond to budget question - 3 respondents

- Responses above a billion dollars - 5 respondents
 - \$3 billion
 - \$1 billion
 - \$4 billion
 - \$8.8 billion
 - \$1.18 billion
- Responses above \$50 million - 5 respondents
 - \$115 million
 - \$400 million
 - \$107 million
 - \$125 million
 - \$700 million
- Responses below \$50 million - 8 respondents
 - \$7.3 million
 - \$17 million
 - \$42.7 million
 - \$20 million
 - \$3.9 million
 - \$1.7 million
 - \$1.6 million
 - \$50 million

Question 6: To your knowledge, what percentage of your department/agency's current budget is allocated for CBO collaboration and engagement?

- 8 respondents say minimal / Not Sure / N/A
- 11 respondents spend 2% or less
- 2 respondents say around 10%;
- 2 respondents spend 3 -10%

Question 7: To your knowledge, does your agency have a written policy or formal commitment to collaborating with CBOs, or is it an ad-hoc and project based approach? Please explain.

- Ad-hoc/Project Based - 16 (There is a desire to create more standard policy)
 - *Notable Comments/Examples:*
 - Strong collaborations exist, no formal policy
 - “Registered community organization (RCO) process”
 - “Bike Fort Collins for Safe Routes to School education” for example
- Specific Strategy - 3
 - *Notable Comments/Examples:*

- “CBO Partnering Strategy”
 - “Pre-Qualification program work types, creation of Ambassador role, education among agencies about CBO's etc.”
 - “Community engagement approach in Strategic Plan and Long Range Vision (Metro Connects).”
- Unsure Strategy - 1
 - *Notable Comments/Examples:*
 - Increase in staff has been able to help create a manual for collaboration and outreach

Question 8: Does your department/agency have formal or structured relationships with CBOs related to transportation project planning, design, and implementation?

– *Preliminary Takeaway:* About 50% of respondents have formal structures in place for collaborating with CBOs

- Yes; we have contracts with CBOs and compensate them for their time - 8
 - **Note:** The interpretation of this question could skew results. It's possible to read this question as having a contract for something that is only project specific versus having a formalized process for collaborating with CBOs. This seems to be likely based on answers to question 7 above (only 3 respondents noted a specific strategy).
- Yes; we have formal/structured CBO relationships, but without steady compensation - 2
- Kind of; we have relationships with CBOs, but they are largely informal/advisory - 4
- No; we do not have direct relationships with CBOs related to transportation project planning, design, or implementation - 2
- We did in the past, but not currently - 0
- Other - 4

Question 9: If "yes" or "kind of" to the previous question, which of the following is true for this statement: *We have contracts with CBO partners for compensated work related to...*

- Project-Specific Planning/ Implementation (15)
- Long-range planning (7)
 - **Note:** Difference between Project-Specific Planning/ Implementation (15) versus Long-range Planning (7) could indicate that most agencies do not have a formalized process for collaborating with CBOs.
- Community outreach ambassadors (13)
- Education (8)

- **Note:** Is this education work for temporary projects or related to long range projects? This term could create some ambiguity for respondents.
- Advocacy (2)
- Data collection and analysis (6)
- Facilitation and workshops (12)
- School-based travel planning (1)
- We don't have formal contracts but collaborate for long-range planning advocacy, and workshops (1)
- Question left blank (2)

Question 10: To your knowledge, please indicate how often each funding source is used by your department/agency for CBO compensation?

– *Preliminary Takeaway:* Most commonly used source of funding is Local; Federal and State funding is most often *not used*. This response tracks with responses to question 12 with “restrictions on funding (11)” and notes about lack of clarity from FHWA and restrictions from State DOT.

	Not Used	Occasionally used (once or twice)	Commonly used (multiple contracts annually)
Federal	10	6	2
State	8	7	3
Local	5	3	12
Private Sector	11	3	2
Other	9	1	1

Question 11: Please indicate what, if any, internal barriers your department/agency usually faces when attempting to collaborate with CBOs.

- **Color Coded Problem Areas include:** bureaucracy (administrative, procurement, financial, legal), structural (staff capacity, agency structure), and cultural (lack of understanding of CBO mission and needs, lack of relationship with CBOs).
 - Administrative (14)
 - Staff Capacity (13)
 - Procurement (14)
 - Financial (8)

- Legal (9)
- Agency Commitment/ Leadership Support (7)
- Not understanding CBO capacity to engage and meet contracting requirements for Metro. Procurements have SBE/DBE designations that make it hard to contract with CBOs. Understanding the role CBOs can play on projects. (1)
- Awareness/education among staff & CBOs around mobility/social justice (1)
- Different processes between different departments at the City (1)
- Pre-award audit process required on all projects over \$50,000 - usually CBOs are not able to go through this process. (1)
- collaborating involves relationship building which means meeting them where they are at with no agenda. This also means respecting their missions and values, especially when it does not align with the agency's goals or project. Another barrier is bureaucracy and policy;; right now we cannot directly compensate CBOs for their work and can only work with them through a consultant which creates a barrier in relationship building and being able to compensate them fairly (1)
- infighting with community orgs! (1)
- Understanding, integration, lived experience - the things you list are barriers but all of those can be overcome, the biggest challenge is fear, and training (1) *FH note: Education??*
- None when contracting for education services. We may use CBOs for community outreach in our upcoming Bike/Ped plan, and I don't know yet what barriers we will encounter.(1)
- cultural conflicts re: City should do what we think is best, vs partner with community and work together (1)

Question 12: Please indicate what, if any, external barriers your department/agency usually faces when attempting to collaborate with CBOs.

- **Color Coded Problem Areas include:** bureaucracy (administrative, procurement, financial, legal), structural (staff capacity, agency structure), and cultural (lack of understanding of CBO mission and needs, lack of relationship with CBOs).
- Community trust/ relationships (12)
- Capacity from CBO, such as limited staff (15)
- Perceived conflict of interests (8)
- Political support/ buy-in (5)
- Restrictions on Funding (11)
- Bid/RFP timelines (8)
- Competing priorities/ not thinking transportation is a priority (1)
- Continuity of staff among CBOs (1) *FH note: Capacity from CBO*
- Push-back from FHWA on compensating CBOs in certain projects. Inconsistent guidance on this topic from FHWA (1): *FH note: Restrictions on Funding*

- Orgs not understanding the transpo project development process (1)
- Stringent requirements from our state DOT contracting staff (1) [FH note: restrictions on funding](#)

Question 13: Does your department/agency have a dedicated system or process in place to identify which CBOs to work with?

- **General Takeaway:** CBO collaboration is more of an afterthought. May impact the equitable process of selecting CBOs - e.g., same CBO selected each time, etc.
- Yes: 3
- No: 12
- It depends on the project: 6

Question 14: Does your department/agency have a team or position(s) dedicated to collaborating with CBOs

- **General Take away:** About 50% of respondents have a dedicated team/ position.
- **Follow up question:** What do those teams consist of? What is their budget? If yes, please briefly provide additional information regarding the size of the team or relevant position(s), their responsibilities, skills and background, and how they collaborate with functions within your department/agency (e.g. procurement, finance, legal, etc.)
 - **Follow up:** Should survey results be disaggregated by operational budget?
- Yes: 10
- No: 11

Question 15: If not, did your department/agency have a team in the past? Why was it removed or paused?

- **Note:** two responses indicate that the agencies recognize the need for a dedicated team to manage collaborations with CBOs.
- “No” - 3
- No. Most work is project based. -1
- More context to previous question - Our office of Communications and Public Engagement is working on setting up systems and processes with our Consultant Services office to work more with CBOs (i.e., a Master List of CBOs, similar to Hennepin County Community Engagement Roster Program). Other offices in the agency are also interested in advancing this work.
- We are hiring a communications/engagement specialist for whom this will be part of their responsibilities
- We work with the mayor's office - neighborhood services group.

Question 16: Would you be interested in talking to us more (being interviewed) and/or staying in touch to further discuss CBO collaboration and barriers?

- **General Take away:** respondents are willing to talk more!
- Yes: 17
- No: 4